

## **Executive Summary**

**Dam Hee Kim<sup>1</sup>**

**University Of Michigan**

To have a better understanding of the nexus between ownership, employment and content, approximately one hundred studies funded by the FCC (Federal Communications Commission) or recognized by the Court were identified.<sup>2</sup> Among the identified studies, forty-two of them including analyses on the nexus between ownership, employment and content were individually read and reviewed. This report aims (a) to demonstrate what the studies found regarding the nexus between ownership, employment and content, (b) to assess strengths and weaknesses of the studies, and (c) to make suggestions for future analyses.

In brief, a review of studies on the nexus between ownership, employment and content suggests that there are nexuses respectively between ownership and employment of minorities and females (Bachen, Hammond, & Mason, 2000; Fife, 1986; Honig, 1983; NAB, 1986; Schement & Singleton, 1981; Turner, 2007), between minority employment and content targeted to minorities (Bachen, Hammond, & Mason, 2000; Honig, 1983), and between minority ownership and content tailored toward minority communities (Bachen, et al., 2000; Crawford, 2007; CRS, 1988; Fife, 1986; Ivy Planning Group LLC, 2000; Jeter, 1981; Turner, 2007; Siegelman & Waldfogel, 2001; Spitzer, 1990; Waldfogel, 2011).

However, these studies are not without weaknesses. To examine nexuses between ownership, employment and content, each concept needs to be defined and measured.

---

<sup>1</sup> Dam Hee Kim: dheekim@umich.edu

In summer 2011, Dam Hee Kim as a COMPASS (Consortium on Media Policy Studies) fellow worked under the direction of the FCC (Federal Communications Commission)'s Associate General Counsel/Chief Diversity Officer, Mark Lloyd in the Office of General Counsel.

<sup>2</sup> These studies include the 2010 Media Ownership Studies as a part of 2010 quadrennial media ownership proceedings, the Media Ownership 2006 Research Studies as a part of the FCC's comprehensive review of its broadcast ownership policies, 2003-2006 Additional Materials, the studies presented in the 2000 Policy Forum On Market Entry Barriers Faced by Small Minority and Women Owned Businesses In the Communications Industry, and the studies recognized in the Metro Broadcasting, Inc. v. the FCC case (1990).

The fundamental weakness involves the limitations of data used to measure minority ownership, employment and content. Also, there was no research study into which two or more services were collectively taken, and the analysis did not lend itself to a causal story involving ownership, employment and content tailored toward minority communities. Still, reasonable causal inferences involving ownership, employment and content might be made by taking the analyses of industry dataset into account along with interpretations of survey and interviews of owners and managers, and content analyses.

This report proposes building on the previous studies by conducting three sets of additional studies focusing on owners/managers, content, and audience to explore the decision making processes related to the nexus between ownership, employment and content. These three sets of studies might inform our understanding of how owners/managers, content and audience interact in a market, and potentially in making possible causal inferences of minority ownership, employment and content.

To be able to tell a comprehensive causal story regarding the nexus between minority ownership, employment, and content, it might be helpful to build a longitudinal dataset including ownership, employment and content information along with some third factors, which might contain audience-related factors. It might be beneficial to take audience into account in debates on the nexus between ownership, employment and content because the audience, or the public, is the paramount interest to be served after all these studies and debates.

Table 1

*The Nexus between Minority Ownership and Employment*

Ne xus	Title	Who	When	Data	Methodology	Service
<b>(a) Analysis of Broadcast Industry Data</b>						
y	Relationships Among EEO, Program Service, and Minority Ownership in Broadcast Regulation	Honig	1983	FCC Form 395 (Equal Employment Report) and <i>Broadcasting Yearbook</i> (80)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (Chi Square)	Radio
y	Minority Broadcasting Facts	National Association of Broadcasters	Sep 1986	National Association of Broadcasters (86)	Quantitative Analysis – Descriptive Statistics	TV
y	The Onus of Minority Ownership: FCC Policy and Spanish-Language Radio	Schement and Singleton	1981	FCC license renewal files	Quantitative Analysis – Descriptive Statistics	Radio
y	Off The Dial: Female and Minority Radio Station Ownership in the United States	Turner	June 2007	Ownership: BIA Media Access Pro (07) and the FCC's CDBS Public Access Database	Quantitative Analysis – Statistical Tests (T-test)	Radio
<b>(b) Analysis of Surveys</b>						
y	Diversity of Programming in the Broadcast Spectrum: Is there a Link between Owner Race or Ethnicity and News and Public Affairs Programming?	Bachen, Hammond, and Mason	Dec 12 2000	Broadcast industry data from NTIA (97), telephone interviews of news/public affairs programming directors by a survey firm (98)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (Chi Square & T-Test)	Radio, TV
<b>(c) Content Analysis</b>						
y	The Impact of Minority Ownership on Minority Images in Local TV News, in Communications: A Key to Economic and Political Change	Fife	1986	Census of Population Report (80), literature reviews on populations in 4 sampled markets, newscasts of one minority-owned and one majority-owned stations in four markets	Quantitative Analysis – Content Analysis	TV

Table 2

*The Nexus between Minority Employment and Content*

Ne xus	Title	Who	When	Data	Methodology	Service
y	Diversity of Programming in the Broadcast Spectrum: Is there a Link between Owner Race or Ethnicity and News and Public Affairs Programming?	Bachen, Hammond, and Mason	Dec 12 2000	Broadcast industry data from NTIA (97), telephone interviews of news/public affairs programming directors by a survey firm (98)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (Chi Square, T- Test, Step-Wise Multiple Regression)	Radio, TV
y	Relationships Among EEO, Program Service, and Minority Ownership in Broadcast Regulation	Honig	1983	FCC Form 395 (Equal Employment Report) and Broadcasting Yearbook (80)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (T-Test)	Radio

Table 3-1

*The Nexus between Minority Ownership and Content*

Nexus	Title	Who	When	Data	Analysis	Service
<b>(a) Analysis of Broadcast Industry Data</b>						
y	Radio Station Ownership Structure and the Provision of Programming to Minority Audiences: Evidence from 2005-2009	Waldfoegel	June 6 2011	Station-level data from Arbitron (GFI 05, 07), Longitudinal Radio_Long.dta from the FCC	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (Regression)	Radio
y	Television Station Ownership Structure and the Quantity and Quality of TV Programming	Crawford	Sep 10 2007	Ownership: from Diwadi, Roberts, and Wise (2007), Programming: Nielson, Program Schedule: TMS, Ratings: Nielson, Kagan, Advertising Minutes: TNS (two weeks of every year between 03-06)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (Regression)	TV
y	Off The Dial: Female and Minority Radio Station Ownership in the United States	Turner	June 2007	Ownership: BIA Media Access Pro (07) and the FCC's CDBS Public Access Database, Radio talk show hosts: program web sites (07)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (t-test)	Radio
y	Race and Radio: Preference Externalities, Minority Ownership, and the Provision of Programming to Minorities	Siegelman, and Waldfoegel	Oct 2001	Duncan's American Radio, Listening: Arbitron's Radio USA, Owner race: NTIA (all 93, 97)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (Regression)	Radio
y	A Comparative Analysis of the Programming Practices of Black-Owned Black-Oriented Radio Stations and White-Owned Black-Oriented Radio Stations	Jeter	1981	Black-oriented stations: Standard Rate and Data Service by Spot Radio Black-owned stations: NAB, NABOB, Black Enterprise, Broadcasting Programming: the license renewal applications by the FCC Playlists: A survey	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Test (Regression)	Radio
<b>(b) Analysis of Surveys and Interviews of Owners and Managers</b>						
y	<b>Diversity of Programming in the Broadcast Spectrum: Is there a Link between Owner Race or Ethnicity and News and Public Affairs Programming?</b>	Bachen, Hammond, and Mason	Dec 12 2000	Broadcast industry data from NTIA (97), telephone interviews of news/public affairs programming directors by a survey firm (98)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (Chi Square & t-test, step-wise multiple regression)	Radio, TV

y	Whose Spectrum Is It Anyway? Historical Study of Market Entry Barriers, Discrimination and Changes in Broadcast and Wireless Licensing	Ivy Planning Group LLC Rockville, Maryland	Dec 12 2000	Telephone interview with 120 key persons representing small, minority- and women-owned business, 30 telephone interviews with key market participants by Ivy (00)	Qualitative Analysis – Interpretation of interviews	Radio, TV, wire-less
y	Minority Broadcast Station Ownership and Broadcast Programming: Is There a Nexus?	CRS (Congressional Research Service)	June 29 1988	A survey of radio and TV stations by the FCC	Quantitative Analysis – Descriptive Statistics	Radio, TV
y	The Impact of Minority Ownership on Minority Images in Local TV News, in Communications: A Key to Economic and Political Change	Fife	1986	Census of Population Report (80), literature reviews on populations in 4 sampled markets, structured interviews at the minority-owned stations, newscasts of one minority-owned and one majority-owned station	Qualitative Analysis – Interpretation of interviews	TV

**(c) Content Analysis**

y	Off The Dial: Female and Minority Radio Station Ownership in the United States	Turner	June 2007	Ownership: BIA Media Access Pro (07) and the FCC's CDBS Public Access Database, Radio talk show hosts: program web sites (07)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (t-test)	Radio
y	The Impact of Minority Ownership on Minority Images in Local TV News, in Communications: A Key to Economic and Political Change	Fife	1986	Census of Population Report (80), literature reviews on populations in 4 sampled markets, newscasts of one minority-owned and one majority-owned stations in four markets	Quantitative Analysis – Content Analysis	TV

**(d) Economic Modeling**

y	Justifying Minority Preferences in Broadcasting	Spitzer	March 1990	Review of theories and evidence of programming choices by profit-maximizing owners	Economic Modeling, Review of opinions in Metro Broadcasting	Radio, TV
---	---	---------	------------	--	---	-----------

Table 3-2

*The Nexus between Minority Ownership and Content*

Nexus	Title	Who	When	Data	Analysis	Service
n	Local Media Ownership and Media Quality	Rennhoff, and Wilbur	June 12 2011	Minority media ownership variable by the FCC (07, 09), TV ratings by Nielson Media Research Galaxy ProFile (05-10)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (Correlations, Regression)	TV, Newspaper, Radio
n	Local Information Programming and the Structure of Television Markets	Erb	May 20 2011	Ownership, market-level industry, and demographics by the FCC media bureau	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (Regression)	TV, Newspaper, Radio
n	News Operations (section III)	Stroup	July 2007	Arbitron markets (02-05)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (Regression)	Radio
n	The Onus of Minority Ownership: FCC Policy and Spanish-Language Radio	Sche-ment and Singleton	1981	FCC license renewal files	Quantitative Analysis -- Descriptive Statistics	Radio
y	Out of The Picture 2007: Minority & Female TV Station Ownership in the United States	Turner and Cooper	Oct 2007	BIA Media Access Pro (06, 07) and the FCC's CDBS Public Access Database, Minority Commercial Broadcast Ownership reports by NTIA (98, 00)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (ANOVA, T-Test, OLS, and Probit Maximum Likelihood Models)	TV
y	Television Station Ownership Structure and the Quantity and Quality of TV Programming	Crawford	Sep 10 2007	Ownership: from Diwadi, Roberts, and Wise (2007), Programming: Nielson, Program Schedule: TMS, Ratings: Nielson, Kagan, Advertising Minutes: TNS (two weeks of every year between 03-06)	Quantitative Analysis -- Statistical Tests (Regression)	TV